

**Rhetorical Structure of Conclusion Chapters in Bachelor TEFL Thesis  
Written by Indonesian Writers**

Ayu Amaliah<sup>1\*</sup> and Ahmad Amin Dalimunte<sup>2</sup>

*<sup>1,2</sup>English Education, State Islamic University of North Sumatera, Medan, Indonesia*

\* Corresponding author: ayuamaliah767@gmail.com

# **Rhetorical Structure of Conclusion Chapters in Bachelor TEFL Thesis Written by Indonesian Writers**

The main purpose of this study is to conduct an in-depth analysis of the rhetorical structure of the conclusion sections in Teaching English as a Foreign Language (TEFL) undergraduate theses written by Indonesian authors. The study aims to explore the moves and steps used in the conclusion section, identifying patterns in the rhetorical structure. This study adopts a qualitative research methodology, The use of a genre analysis emphasis broadens the area of the investigation and makes it easier to recognize and understand the recurrent rhetorical devices and conventions that authors use. Based on the results of the analysis that has been conducted thoroughly on 10 theses. We found that Move 4 (Deduction from the research) is the dominant move with a total of 18 occurrences (38.29%). It is followed by Move 1 (Introducing the conclusion chapter) and Move 2 (Summarizing the research) with 10 occurrences and a percentage of 21.28%. The last is followed by Move 3 (Evaluating the research) with 9 occurrences and a percentage of 19.15%.

Keywords: conclusion chapter; genre analysis; move and step; rhetorical structure; undergraduate TEFL theses

## **Introduction**

Writing a thesis for undergraduate students has undeniable significance in their academic journey (Graham & Harris, 1997). It is not just a final assignment to obtain a bachelor's degree, but also a golden opportunity to develop a number of critical skills and abilities (Simandan, 2019). The process of producing an academic thesis improves one's ability to communicate in writing. Students need to be able to communicate their ideas and findings coherently and clearly (Vasudevan et al., 2023). This skill is essential in academic and professional settings. Completing a thesis also shows a student's commitment, self-control, and endurance during their academic career. This achievement not only provides personal satisfaction, but also creates an academic record that can be recognized by higher education institutions and potential employers. Writing a thesis is not just about reaching graduation requirements; it is also about developing the skills and character required to take on difficulties in the professional and academic realms (Carter-thomas & Rowley-jolivet, 2020).

Apart from being a major milestone in the development of academic skills, thesis writing also opens doors to deep insights into practice and theory in various fields of study. Such is the case in the field of Teaching English as a Foreign Language (TEFL), where the thesis writing process connects conceptual understanding with practical application in the context of English language teaching (Malmkjær, 1991). The significance of thesis writing in Teaching English as a Foreign Language (TEFL) goes beyond the confines of academia and into the core of successful language pedagogy and instructional methodology (Han & Zhang, 2020). Besides that, it is impossible to overestimate the importance of being proficient in English as a means of worldwide communication and as a doorway to a variety of educational and career options (Pishghadam & Zabihi, 2012).

Acknowledging the global nature of Teaching English as a Foreign Language (TEFL), writing proficiency in this field is also considered an essential skill to be able to make pedagogical implications in academic writing. In this context, the conclusion chapter of a thesis assumes heightened significance, serving as the pinnacle of the research endeavour (Paltridge, 2002). The conclusion chapter of a thesis holds undeniable significance as a crucial component in the overall academic writing (Ingram, 2021). As the final chapter of the thesis, the conclusion stands as a crucial point when theory, methods, and results are all tightly interwoven (Salman & Yaseen, 2013). The concluding chapter provides an overview of the importance of systematic patterns to thoroughly elaborate research practices carried out by researchers, as well as presenting a summary of the main ideas from all parts of the research and their research contributions to future research. This is the basis that a researcher must have and master the ability to develop a concise but still clear and relevant conclusion chapter that covers the essence of all the research that has been carried out, not least for undergraduate students in writing their thesis chapter (Vasudevan et al., 2023). This skill provides them the ability to effectively communicate complex ideas and make significant contributions to their fields. As a result, the conclusion chapter is essential for both summarizing the students' academic work and creating their identity as developing researchers.

Nowadays, in exploring the importance of conclusion chapter in undergraduate thesis writing, adopting a framework such as genre analysis becomes crucial. Genre analysis provides a systematic and structured approach to understanding the different conventions and rhetorical features inherent in academic writing written by and

Indonesian writers, without exception to the specific genre of thesis conclusions. This analytical framework allows researchers to dissect how conclusions function within the larger framework of academic discourse, shedding light on the distinctive patterns and expectations associated with this critical chapter (Mestre-Mestre, 2017). By applying genre analysis, researchers can investigate the rhetorical strategies employed by Indonesian writers in structuring conclusion chapter in the field of Teaching English as a Foreign Language (TEFL). A more comprehensive examination of language use, genre analysis takes consideration not only the structure of texts but also how they are understood, utilized, and abused in certain situations to serve particular objectives (Bhatia, 2002).

Move analysis is one genre-based approach that is becoming increasingly important in identifying and determining the structure of research articles or theses (Swales, 2014). This approach allows for a comprehensive examination of the linguistic choices, structures, elements, and communicative purposes embedded in the conclusion, thus facilitating a nuanced understanding of the patterns and rhetoric that shape this academic writing (Nguyen & Pramoolsook, 2016a). This approach highlights the potential in the way Indonesian writers summarize their research findings, discuss implications, and suggest future directions. Through genre analysis, this study seeks to uncover the patterns and rhetoric of how the conclusion sections of TEFL theses written by Indonesian undergraduate students are organized. Ultimately, the use of genre analysis in this study provides a methodological foundation to systematically uncover the intricacies of the conclusion section. Using this approach, this study aims to contribute not only to the understanding of rhetorical nuances in TEFL thesis writing, but also to the broader discourse on genre-specific practices in academic writing. As such, the adoption of genre analysis becomes an important tool to gain deeper insights into conclusion construction of academic writing in the context of Teaching English as a Foreign Language.

Despite the importance of the conclusion chapter, undergraduate students often face challenges in effectively constructing this important part of their thesis. One common problem is a lack of coherence and clarity in communicating the main ideas and implications of the research (Fitria, 2022). This can stem from a limited understanding of how to structure a conclusion chapter that can summarize research findings and articulate their significance appropriately and effectively. Kurniati (2019) stated that most

undergraduate students often make common mistakes, such as introducing new information in the conclusion chapter that was not present in the chapter before the conclusion chapter. Such mistakes can obscure the overall message of the thesis and reduce the clarity and precision of the conclusions chapter (Wang & Yang, 2012). In several studies, undergraduate students also often fail to provide a concise presentation of the research findings in the conclusion chapter (Sadeghi & Khajepasha, 2015). This reduces the effectiveness of the conclusion chapter as a clear and informative summary of the research that has been conducted. Therefore, it is important for undergraduate students to deeply understand the conventions of writing a conclusion chapter and identify and avoid common mistakes that often occur in the thesis writing process (Faryadi, 2019). Thus, the quality and academic impact of the thesis can be significantly improved, creating a more meaningful contribution to scientific writing.

Several previous studies have carried out analyses in their research which reveal differences between disciplines, languages, formulas between native writers versus non-native writers in terms of the rhetorical structure of a research article or thesis. Vazifehdan et al. (2016) has investigated in his research that presents a genre-based comparative study focusing on the conclusion sections of twenty sociological research articles, written in Persian and English. By using Moritz et al. (2008) model within the framework of Swales genre analysis, this research aims to identify general movements in this concluding section. The analysis includes a qualitative approach to examine the type, sequence, and frequency of movements, followed by a comparison of the frequency structures between Persian and English corpora to reveal similarities and differences. The findings showed that move 2 appeared often in both datasets, with the distribution of steps differing just slightly. Persian writers indicated a weaker line of textual organization than English writers because they employed a smaller number of move 3 than writers of the English corpus. In contrast to the writers of the English corpus, the Persian writers demonstrated a significant predisposition toward providing a detailed explanation of their thesis, as evidenced by the high frequency of move 4 in their writings.

Annuai & Wannaruk (2013) have conducted a study focusing on the conclusion sections of English research articles published in Thai and international journals in the field of applied linguistics. A comparative analysis was conducted between 20 conclusion sections from international journals and 20 conclusion sections from Thai journals written by Thai authors. Yang & Allison's (2003) framework model was used to analyze both

datasets. The findings showed that the three steps in the framework model were present in both datasets, but the frequency of occurrence was different. Move 1 (Summarizing the study) was the most frequently occurring Move in both datasets. Then the number of occurrences of Move 2 (Evaluating the study) and Move 3 (Deductions from the research) were more frequent in the international corpus than in the Thai corpus.

Zamani & Ebadi (2016) have explored the structural analysis of conclusion sections in Research Papers (RPs) in the fields of Civil Engineering and Applied Linguistics, by comparing Persian and English papers published in international journals. Using Ying & Allison's (2003) move model, this study examined 20 RPs to identify moves in the conclusion section. Frequency analysis showed little difference in the use of moves, but Chi-Square tests showed no significant difference between the conclusion sections of Applied Linguistics and Civil Engineering RPs, as well as between Persian and English RPs. The most commonly used moves across both groups and fields were 'summarize the study' and 'indicate significance', while variations existed in the optional moves 'indicate limitations' and 'evaluate methodology' in Step 2.

Nguyen & Pramoolsook (2016) conducted a study that explores the challenges faced by Vietnamese master's students (M.A.), particularly English teachers, in writing thesis conclusion chapters in English. The research focuses on 24 Vietnamese teachers and uses Chen and Kuo's (2012) framework to analyze conclusion chapters in Applied Linguistics. The findings show that Step 4 (Conclusion of the research) is consistently present in every chapter, indicating its mandatory nature. Step 1 (Introducing the conclusion chapter) and Step 2 (Summarizing the research) are conventional, indicating a linear structure in building the conclusion chapter. In addition, a new step (Chapter summary) was identified, along with the rare occurrence of the previous chapter summary and the next chapter introduction cycle-every chapter summary. These results not only show a certain pattern in the Vietnamese writers' conclusion chapters, but also demonstrate the rhetorical influence of Vietnamese discourse on their English writing.

Avena & Yumarnamto (2022) in their research focused on investigating the organizational patterns of thesis conclusions written by students in the English education program at a private university in East Java, Indonesia. Using genre analysis, this study analysed 24 undergraduate thesis conclusions from 2017 to 2019, with a balanced distribution between 12 quantitative and 12 qualitative theses. A framework for genre analysis, based on Bunton's (2005) model for the general structure of conclusions, was

used to identify key steps and measures. They managed to reveal that most of the conclusions followed the generic structure suggested by Bunton, indicating the mastery of academic genres by the students. However, variations in the organization of thesis conclusions were observed between the quantitative and qualitative groups, reflecting different preferences in the organization of steps and measures. The research concludes by discussing the pedagogical implications of these findings for teaching English as a foreign language (TEFL).

Bunton (2005) has investigated the general structure of Conclusion chapters in PhD theses or dissertations by analysing 45 theses from two different disciplines, 30 corpora from science and technology discipline and 15 corpora from humanities and social sciences discipline. The research identifies and examines chapters that serve as closures, focusing on their functional moves and steps. Most Conclusions were observed to follow a pattern that 'restates the objectives', 'consolidates the research space' with diverse steps, 'recommends future research', and includes 'practical applications', 'implications', or 'recommendations. However, a minority of Conclusions were found to prioritize a broader field than the thesis itself, often adopting a 'problem-solving' or 'argumentative text structure.' In addition, this study also identified variations in focus and structure among different disciplines.

Morales (2012) has conducted a study comparing organizational steps and mandatory steps in the conclusion section of research articles (RA) written by Filipino and Japanese authors. The analysis revealed cross-cultural variations in rhetorical preferences, where Filipino authors emphasized their study's potential contribution to knowledge, while Japanese authors used concise summaries of key points, reflecting a cultural rhetorical pattern called "ketsu." The findings suggest that Filipino writers consider pointing out the significance and evaluating the research as mandatory steps, while Japanese writers prioritize summarizing the research.

In the other study that has been conducted by Aslam & Mehmood (2014) examined the macro-structures of conclusion sections in Researchs Articles (RAs) within the contexts of Social Sciences and Natural Sciences, focusing on differences in moves and steps across various disciplines. Using a sample of 50 RAs, 25 from each discipline and written by Pakistani writers, a new model for move analysis is proposed based on Yang & Allison's (2003) and Bunton's (2005) models. The analysis reveals variations in

move structures across disciplines, offering insights into the nature of conclusions in RAs within the Pakistani context.

Although there have been many studies on various aspects of thesis writing in the conclusion chapter, the existing studies mostly focus on the academic level, such as master's and doctoral theses, thus leaving a considerable gap in understanding how undergraduate students in the field of TEFL structure the conclusion section of their theses. Based on the previous research that the author has outlined, there are still relatively few genre analysis studies that specifically investigate the rhetorical structures and patterns in the conclusion chapters in the theses of undergraduate students in Teaching English as a Foreign Language (TEFL), especially in the context of Indonesian writers.

Addressing this gap is crucial to improving our understanding of specific genre-based practices in TEFL students' academic writing, providing insights that can inform pedagogical approaches, as well as thesis guidance and technical guidance in diverse linguistic and cultural contexts. Therefore, the researcher intends to conduct a study entitled "The Rhetorical Structure of Conclusion Chapters in TEFL Undergraduate Theses Written by Indonesian Writers". The research began with an investigation using genre analysis - a movement-based genre approach to uncover how Indonesian students structured the conclusion sections in their undergraduate theses.

Based on the explanation above, several problem formulation questions can be made, such as: What moves and steps occurred in the conclusion chapters in Indonesian theses? What are the common patterns of moves and steps in the conclusion chapters in Indonesian theses? The main purpose of this study is to conduct an in-depth analysis of the rhetorical structure of the conclusion sections in Teaching English as a Foreign Language (TEFL) undergraduate theses written by Indonesian authors. The study aims to explore the moves and steps used in the conclusion section, identifying patterns in the rhetorical structure. By using genre analysis with a step-based genre approach, the researcher also sought to uncover genre discipline practices in TEFL students' academic writing, specifically focusing on the conclusion chapter.

## **Method**

The focus and purpose of this study is to conduct a comparative analysis of the rhetorical structure of conclusion sections in Teaching English as a Foreign Language (TEFL) undergraduate theses written by Indonesian writers. The research aims to explore



the moves and steps used in the conclusion section, identify patterns in the rhetorical structure, and examine the similarities and differences between the two groups of theses. The main purpose is to enhance our understanding of specific genre-based practices in TEFL students' academic writing, thus informing pedagogical approaches and thesis guidance in diverse linguistic and cultural contexts.

This study adopts a qualitative research methodology as it offers a nuanced exploration of the rhetorical structures embedded within conclusion chapters of bachelor TEFL theses. By delving into the qualitative realm, this research method allows for an in-depth analysis of written discourse, permitting the uncovering of subtle linguistic nuances and cultural intricacies that shape the construction of conclusions. The use of a genre analysis emphasis broadens the area of the investigation and makes it easier to recognize and understand the recurrent rhetorical devices and conventions that authors use. Through qualitative inquiry and genre analysis, this research aims to unravel the complexities of rhetorical structure within the context of TEFL theses, shedding light on the interplay between language, culture, and academic discourse practices.

### *Analytical Framework*

Chen and Kuo's analytical framework is used as the analytical framework in this study. Chen & Kuo's (2012) analytical framework is a genre-based approach that emphasizes the systematic analysis of textual structures and rhetorical features closely related to academic writing. This framework allows researchers to dissect how conclusion chapters are useful not only as the conclusion of a piece of writing, but have a broader function and context than just academic discourse. Chen & Kuo's (2012) framework illustrate different patterns and expectations related to this important part of a thesis. Chen & Kuo's (2012) framework for genre analysis has been used to analyze the rhetorical structure of various chapters in bachelor's and master's theses, including the conclusion chapter. This framework focuses on the step-by-step structure in various thesis chapters, aiming to understand how these genres are constructed and to identify rhetorical differences and similarities.

Chen & Kuo's (2012) framework was chosen as the analytical framework in this study because it is considered capable of providing a solid foundation for systematically analyzing the rhetorical structure of the conclusion chapter. In the context of an undergraduate thesis in Applied Linguistics and TEFL, this analytical framework proves

its worth by providing a clear and complete guide in identifying and categorizing important rhetorical elements. By understanding the series of moves and steps commonly found in conclusion chapters, researchers can uncover the main rhetorical functions contained within them.

The steps listed in the framework not only facilitate a summary of the main findings, but also allow for an in-depth discussion of the implications of the research as well as suggestions for future research directions. In this regard, the framework not only provides general guidance, but also gives specific instructions on the effective organization and presentation of content for each step. By applying this approach, researchers can identify strengths and weaknesses in the organization of the conclusion chapter of the thesis under study.

### ***Step of Data Collection***

The data collection process was carried out through several stages. The stages that the researchers did were as follows. First, we accessed the University Repository by going through the repository website or UINSU database to search for English education undergraduate theses written by Indonesian students. Second, we searched for English Education theses. We used the search feature on the repository website to find the theses related to the field of English another related terms. Thirdly, we conducted a review in selecting theses that were deemed relevant by reading the title, then the abstract, then scanning the conclusion section to identify theses that fit the focus of our research. Then we selected ten theses that were most relevant to our research for further download. We made sure that the downloaded files were full text, especially the conclusion chapter which was the focus of our research.

### ***Samples***

The data consisted of 10 theses written Indonesian undergraduate students. The researcher focused on the conclusion section of each thesis, which will then be analyzed using (Chen & Kuo, 2012) analytical framework.

Analyzing 10 theses that are arguably limited aims to allow researchers to conduct detailed and in-depth analysis. With a smaller sample size, the researcher believes that the research results obtained are valid and reliable. In addition, the 10 theses selected have represented one field, namely TEFL with a broader scope written by Indonesian students,

especially undergraduate English education. By carefully and thoroughly selecting these 10 theses based on their relevance to the focus of the study, the researcher ensured that the sample accurately reflected the distinctive characteristics and diversity within the field. In addition, since the main focus of this study was the conclusion section of each thesis, the 10 theses selected were those that had conclusion sections that were most relevant to the focus and purpose of the study.

**Table 1. Description of Corpus Data**

<b>Theses</b>	<b>The Title of Indonesian Theses</b>	<b>Word Count</b>
Theses 1 (Irawan, 2020)	Utilizing Pictures Series to Improve the Students' Proficiency Writing Skill of Recount Text at the Tenth Grade of Senior High School	531
Theses 2 (Marpaung, 2021)	The Use of Visual Imagery Strategy to Improve the Students' Writing Skill of Recount Text at the Tenth Grade in MA. LAB. UINSU MEDAN	320
Theses 3 (Marpaung, 2021)	Utilizing Flashcard Media to Improve Students' Vocabulary Mastery at the Seventh Grade of MTS Boarding School Tahfidz Baitusy Syakirin in 2020/2021 Academic Year	479
Theses 4 (Aswadima, 2019)	Improving the Student's Achievement in Listening by Using Video at Grade XI of MAS Bani Hasyim Bahorok	301
Theses 5 (Prastica, 2021)	Improving Students' Writing Ability at Learning Procedure Text Using Reconstruction Activities Strategy at XI Grade Students of MAS PAB 2 Helvetia	542
Theses 6 (Raja Guk-Guk, 2019)	Using Facebook Closed Group to Improve the Students' Writing Skill in Recount Text at Tenth Grade Students of SMK Istiqlal Deli Tua	475
Theses 7 (Siahaan, 2020)	Improving Students' Listening Skills Through Podcast at MTS Islamiyah Gunting Saga	532
Theses 8 (Hirah, 2021)	The Effect of Applying Paired Story Telling Technique on Students' Reading Comprehension of Eight Grade at MTS Azzuhri Tanjung Morawa	350
Theses 9 (Fikriyah, 2023)	The Effectiveness of Spelling Bee Game to Improve the Students' Pronunciation at Seventh Grade of SMP Islam Terpadu Nurul 'Ilmi Medan	375
Theses 10 (Nadeak, 2022)	An Analysis of Speech Act on English Teaching and Learning Process in SMP Muhammadiyah 51 Sidikalang	305

We conducted an in-depth analysis of the conclusion sections in five master's theses written by Indonesian students. These theses covered various subject areas in Teaching English as a Foreign Language (TEFL) covering topics such as academic writing, teaching methods and higher order thinking skills. The conclusion chapters presented in these theses showed variations in word count, with the overall average number of words being 421, while the total are 4210 words.

### ***Reliability of the Findings***

Reliability is an instrument for researchers who have conducted research and proven that the research they have conducted is of high quality and can be trusted (Mohajan, 2017). The reliability of the findings in this study was further strengthened by the use of a dual coding approach, where two independent coders were involved in the analysis process. This methodological strategy increases credibility and trust in research conclusions by minimizing the potential for bias and error in the coding process (Coleman et al., 2021). Additionally, the inclusion of multiple coders allows for a more comprehensive and nuanced analysis of the concluding chapters. Each coder brought their own perspectives and insights to the analysis, thereby enriching the interpretation of the data and reducing the possibility of overlooking important details or nuances in the rhetorical strategies used by Indonesian undergraduate students. Next, each coder analyzed several excerpts or around 63% of the total corpus.

The coder is an undergraduate student majoring in English education at the University State Islamic University of North Sumatera, she was chosen because she has experience and has conducted research with the same focus and area. Percent agreement was used to calculate inter-coder reliability coefficients, with similarity serving as a proxy for agreement. It is calculated by dividing the number of coding agreements by the two coders (Orwin, 1994). Orwin (1994) said that results greater than 75% can be said to be reliable. Therefore, the coding results obtained from the analysis are 80%, indicating that the coding is credible and reliable.

## **Finding and Discussion**

### ***Findings***

This research begins with a thorough exploration through the lens of genre analysis, to attempt to uncover the various rhetorical strategies, patterns and procedures

used by Indonesian undergraduate students when composing the ‘conclusion’ chapter of their thesis. By conducting genre analysis research on each of the Moves and Steps, the main purpose of this research is to contribute not only to the world of academic writing, but by better understanding the rhetorical structure of the conclusion chapters written by Indonesian undergraduate students we can know a more general discourse on effective scientific communication in academic contexts.

*Moves and steps occurrences of the conclusion chapters from the ten theses*

Based on the results of the analysis that has been conducted thoroughly on 10 theses. We found that *Move 4 (Deduction from the research)* is the dominant move with a total of 18 occurrences (38.29%). It is followed by *Move 1 (Introducing the conclusion chapter)* and *Move 2 (Summarizing the research)* with 10 occurrences and a percentage of 21.28%. The last is followed by *Move 3 (Evaluating the research)* with 9 occurrences and a percentage of 19.15%. To see more clearly the percentage results of each Moves, table 2 below presents the findings of all the analysed moves.

**Table 2. Frequency of Occurrence of Move in the Theses**

<b>Moves</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>Percentage</b>
Move 1: Introducing the Conclusion Chapter	10	21.28%
Move 2: Summarizing the study	10	21.28%
Move 3: Evaluating the study	9	19.15%
Move 4: Deduction from the research	18	38.29%
<b>Total</b>	<b>47</b>	<b>100%</b>

We have found 47 total steps from 10 thesis conclusion chapters that have been analysed. Three steps were found to be dominant with a frequency of occurrence of 10 times which means they appeared in all theses and a percentage of 21.28%, namely Move 1 Step 1 (Restating purpose, design, research question/hypotheses, results, or indicating how conclusions are presented), Move 2 Step 1 (Summarizing the study), and Move 4 Step 3 (Making suggestions). After the three steps above, we found Move 3 Step 1 with a frequency of occurrence of 7 times and a percentage of 14.39%. Then followed by Move 4 Step 1 (Recommending further research) with a frequency of occurrence of 6 times and a percentage of 12.77%. We found 2 Steps with a total frequency of occurrence of 2 times

and a percentage of 4.26%, namely Move 3 Step 2 (Indicating limitations) and Move 4 Step 2 (Drawing pedagogic implications).

**Table 3. Frequency of Occurrence of Steps in the Theses**

<b>Moves and steps</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>Percentage</b>
<b>Move 1: Introducing the Conclusion Chapter</b>		
Restating purpose, design, research question/hypotheses, result, or indicating how conclusion are presented.	10	21.28%
<b>Move 2: Summarizing the study</b>		
Summarizing the study briefly	10	21,28%
<b>Move 3: Evaluating the study</b>		
Indicating significance/advantage	7	14.39%
Indicating limitations	2	4.26%
Evaluating methodology	0	0
<b>Move 4: Deduction from the research</b>		
Recommending further research	6	12.77%
Drawing pedagogic implication	2	4.26%
Making suggestion	10	21.28%
<b>Referring to other studies</b>	0	0
<b>Total</b>	47	100%

In order to the readers can get a more detailed explanation of the previously presented table of analysis results. In the following, we present some evidence of Move and Step findings that appear most and least in the theses. Marker words or lexical words are marked in bold in each excerpt.

**Move 1 Step 1: Restating purpose, design, research question/hypotheses, result, or indicating how conclusion are presented**

Following the model of Chen and Kuo (2012), Step 1 step 1 aims to start the conclusion paragraph which can be in the form of hypothesis presentation, result presentation, and design presentation. The following excerpts indicate how the move was used in the data.

- (1) First, the increase is evident in the increased value of students from pre-test to post-test cycle of the first and second post-test cycle. **In the pre-test students who received grades of 75 or more as many as 13 out of 29 students (44.8%).** In the post test cycle, I students who received grades of 75 or more as many as 22 out of 29 students (75.8%) in post-test cycle II students who scored 75 or more 26 than 29 students (89.6%). From the first test until the third test, the majority of student scores increased from the first test to the third test. *(Thesis 1)*
- (2) The mean of pretest was 50,85 and the students who passed the CMA (criteria minimum of achievement) 10 %, the mean of post-test 1 was 69,4 and the students who passed the CMA (criteria minimum of achievement) 55 %, and the mean of post-test 2 was 79,3 and the students who passed the CMA (criteria minimum of achievement) 90 %. There was an improvement in each cycle. *(Theses 2)*
- (3) In pre-cycle, only 3 students achieved passed the test which is **only 15 % with means 59,1 in the cycle II**, there was improvement, the students that passed the test were 50 % which was 10 students with means 72,3 and the last in the cycle II, there was 75 % improvement, which was 17 students passed the test with means 81,4. *(Theses 3)*
- (4) After conducting the research and analyzing the data, the researcher comes to several conclusions to answer the problems of the research they are: In the preliminary study, students writing recount text was found still low. It was proven by the result of quantitative and qualitative data. **When the test in the preliminary study was given, quantitatively, the students score in the average was only 54.43. It was only 23,07%, or 6 of 32 students passed the test in preliminary study.** Qualitatively, based on the result of the interview and observation showed that the students writing recount text were still low, they found difficulties in writing text. *(Theses 6)*
- (5) The application of strategies for partnered Story telling has a substantial impact on the students' ability to comprehend what they read. The value of tobserved was 19,243, which was higher than the value of ttable, which was 2.01 (19,243 was more than 2.01). This indicates that H0 is not correct and that Ha is the correct hypothesis. Therefore, there is a considerable effect that using the approach of paired story telling can have on the reading comprehension of students. *(Theses 8)*
- (6) Based on the analysis of the data, the testing hypothesis and the discussion the previous chapter, the conclusion can be drawn that spelling bee games is effective to improve the student's pronunciation at the seventh-grade students of SMP IT Nurul 'Ilmi in the academic year of 2022/2023. **It can be seen from the result of the mean score of post-test experimental group was higher than mean of post-test control group (81.75>75.75). In addition the result of t-test was higher than t-table was (2.478>1.686).** *(Theses 9)*

### **Move 2 Step 1: Summarizing the Study Briefly**

In accordance with Chen & Kuo's (2012) model, the primary goal of Move 2 step 1 (Summarizing the Study Briefly) is to emphasize and summarize the study's results. Move 2 Step 1 appeared in each of the ten TEFL bachelor's theses. The usage of present

or past simple phrases is one of the lexical cues that have been identified to denote a conclusion. The way the move was applied to the data is shown by the following excerpts.

- (1) Based on the qualitative data; interview and observation, **the students showed the good responses in the learning process via online through whatsapp group.** Those responses showed that using visual imagery can improve the students' writing skill especially in writing recount text. *(Theses 2)*
- (2) Based on the finding and discussion obtained in this study, the data were taken from qualitative and quantitative data by the researcher. The researcher **found learning vocabulary by using Flashcard media has a positive impact in improving students' vocabulary skills** which is characterized by improving student learning completeness in each of cycle. *(Theses 3)*
- (3) After doing the script, **the writer found that the use of English video in the classroom improved students' listening achievement in understanding narrative story.** It was reflected from the improvement of the student's listening performance along those eight meetings. **The students felt more enjoyable and interested in learning narrative story by using video.** *(Theses 4)*
- (4) Finally, **the researchers can conclude that the applying of Reconstruction Activities Strategy success to improve students' writing ability** in writing procedure text at XI-MIA Grade students of MAS PAB Helvetia. *(Theses 5)*
- (5) The students need a learning media to assist learning, such as the use of media in the classroom. Therefore, this research aims to develop a game to solve students' problem of pronunciation. **It can be concluded that the use of spelling bee games to improve the students' pronunciation is effective to improve their pronunciation mastery.** *(Theses 9)*
- (6) Meanwhile, In Assertive students produced 3 utterances, in expressive students produces 1 utterance and in directive students produced 2 utterances. **It's concluded that Teacher produced 30 utterances and Students produces 6 utterances.** *(Theses 10)*

#### **Move 4 Step 3: Making suggestions**

In accordance with the Chen & Kuo's (2012) model, the main purpose of Step 4 Step 3 (Making suggestion) is to provide useful recommendations based on the research findings. This section also serves to identify areas or aspects that require further research. In addition, the suggestions presented also aim to provide practical recommendations that can be implemented by practitioners, industries, or related organisations, to improve policies, procedures, or practices based on the research findings.

- (1) **The students should be more active** to practice Reviews their ability in studying writing. Picture series is one way that could be chosen by the students Because they can write the text so simply. The students could be more talk of active communicative during the process of learning. *(Theses 1)*
- (2) Flashcard Media can be used and effective media in teaching learning process, especially in vocabulary material and it also can make students vocabulary mastery is improving. Therefore, **the researcher suggests teachers** for implementing this media in their classroom and teachers should have to give



more attention when made this Flashcard Media such as teachers should make this media with big size and colorful, for making students understand and clear when looking the Flashcard Media. *(Theses 3)*

- (3) It is suggested for English teachers to use video in listening class in order to improve students' listening comprehension. **It is better to choose the appropriate video** material which is completed with a good pronunciation and familiar words in order to fit the tape with the student's ability. *(Theses 4)*
- (4) **Students should always be active** in the teaching-learning process. When the teacher explains the material, students should pay attention to the explanation. **The students should study hard** and feel motivated to develop their writing skill. They should practice writing either inside or outside of the class without hesitating and being afraid of making mistakes. *(Theses 6)*
- (5) **English teachers can make English podcasts** as a means of learning to listen to English. This is very possible because podcasts can improve listening skills in English. In addition, there are also many discussion topics and themes that can be chosen so that they can attract students' interest in learning English. **English teachers can also implement lesson planning** by supporting podcast implementation. That way students will not be bored and interested in learning. *(Theses 7)*
- (6) **The students should be active** on teaching and learning process and the students should be learn more about pronunciation so it can be improving their skills in pronouncing English. **The students should participate in all activities** that teacher applied on teaching and learning process. *(Theses 9)*

### Move 3 Step 2: Indicating Limitations

Based on Chen and Kuo's (2012) model, said that the primary goal of Move 3 step 2 (Indicating limitations) is to draw attention to the study's limitations. It indicates that some topics are beyond the scope of the study's investigation. On the other hand, Move 3 Step 2 was determined to have an overall percentage of 4.26% in two theses, according to the investigation. Therefore, we draw the conclusion that mentioning limitations in the concluding chapter is optional and should only be used to support other strategies. The way the move was applied to the data is shown by the excerpts that follows.

- (1) ...It can be concluded that the use of spelling bee games to improve the students' pronunciation is effective to improve their pronunciation mastery. **However, this study still has limitations of research samples.** Research on the effectiveness of learning media still needs to be conducted with larger samples and more different groups of people. *(Theses 9)*
- (2) The researcher expected that **the limitation of this research** encourages other researchers who wish to carry out similar study to investigate more about speech act. It is also suggested to enlarge the study by investigating all types of speech acts since the present study has not explored it yet. Moreover, could make some progress of this study. *(Theses 9)*

## Move 4 Step 2: Drawing Pedagogic Implications

Chen & Kuo (2012) indicated that the purpose of this step is to state what this research can contribute to the existing knowledge in the field. In this study, it was found that Move 4 Step 2 only appeared in 2 theses, with a percentage of 4.26%.

- (1) In this study **the implications** are drawn from the research findings. The results obtained by researcher from this study, researcher found that there was **an increase in students' listening skills** using podcast media. In addition, **this study implies that the application of podcasts is needed by teacher** to send learning materials in listening classes to students, and make it easier to understand. Based on the above conclusions, it can be shown that **the use of podcasts can be a means to encourage the improvement of students' listening skills** as seen from the progress of student grades after using podcasts. *(Theses 7)*
- (2) Analyses have consequences. The study found that paired **story telling improves reading comprehension compared to lecturing**. This study implies story telling isn't necessary for reading comprehension. **Students are more enthused and calmer when learning to read via paired story telling**. *(Theses 8)*

### *Moves and steps structure of the conclusion chapters from the ten theses*

This section aims to dissect the rhetorical moves and specific steps used by authors to effectively summarise their research, highlight important findings, and suggest implications or future directions. By examining these structural components, we will gain insight into common practices and strategies used in academic writing. The following analysis will detail the occurrences and patterns of these moves and measures, providing a clear picture of how conclusions are made to fulfil scholarly expectations and communicate research results effectively. The following table 3 will illustrate the frequency and distribution of each identified Moves across the ten theses, providing a visual representation of the structural tendencies in the conclusion chapter.

**Table 3. The Pattern of Moves and Steps**

<b>Theses</b>	<b>Moves and Step Pattern</b>
Theses 1	Move 2 – Move 1 – Move 3 Step 1 – Move 4 Step 3 – Move 4 Step 1
Theses 2	Move 1 – Move 2 – Move 3 Step 1 – Move 4 Step 3
Theses 3	Move 2 – Move 3 Step 1 – Move 1 – Move 4 Step 3 – Move 4 Step 1
Theses 4	Move 2 – Move 3 Step 1 – Move 1 – Move 4 Step 3
Theses 5	Move 1 – Move 3 Step 1 – Move 2 – Move 4 Step 3

---

Theses 6	Move 1 – Move 2 – Move 4 Step 3 – Move 4 Step 1
Theses 7	Move 1 – Move 2 – Move 3 Step 1 – Move 4 Step 3 – Move 4 Step 1 – Move 4 Step 2
Theses 8	Move 2 – Move 1 – Move 4 Step 3 – Move 4 Step 2
Theses 9	Move 1 – Move 3 Step 1 – Move 2 – Move 3 Step 2 – Move 4 Step 3 – Move 4 Step 1
Theses 10	Move 1 – Move 2 – Move 4 Step 3 – Move 3 Step 2 – Move 4 Step 1

---

Based on the analysis that has been done on each of the moves that appear, out of the 10 theses that have been analysed, there are at least 6 moves structures appeared. From the 6 moves structures found, the most frequent pattern is the linear pattern (M1-M2-M3-M4), with the number of occurrences 3 times (50%). This pattern shows that thesis writers tend to follow a logical and systematic order in structuring their conclusions, starting from reintroducing the topic, summarising the main findings, discussing implications, to suggesting further research or practical recommendations.

Furthermore, two patterns were found with a total of 2 occurrences (33.33%) respectively, namely (M2-M3-M1-M4) and (M1-M3-M2-M4). The pattern (M2-M3-M1-M4) illustrates that some authors prefer to discuss the implications of the findings before re-summarising the main findings and then providing recommendations, while the pattern (M1-M3-M2-M4) shows another variation where the authors present the main findings first, followed by the implications, and then re-summarise the findings before providing recommendations.

In addition, three patterns were found with a total only one occurrence (16.7%) respectively, namely (M2-M1-M3-M4), (M1-M2-M4), and (M2-M1-M4). The pattern (M2-M1-M3-M4) indicates that some authors start with the implications of the findings, followed by a reintroduction of the topic, then summarise the main findings, and finally provide recommendations. Meanwhile, the patterns (M1-M2-M4) and (M2-M1-M4) show a simpler structure and vary in the presentation of the order of the moves, where some components may be omitted or presented in a different order depending on the authors' focus and purpose in the conclusion of their thesis.

Thus, despite the variation in the structure of thesis conclusion moves, the linear pattern (M1-M2-M3-M4) remains the most dominant. This indicates a tendency to follow a more conventional and easy-to-understand structure in drafting conclusions. This analysis not only provides an overview of how thesis conclusions are structured, but can also serve as a guide for thesis writers in designing effective conclusions that conform to common academic practices.

## ***Discussion***

The primary goal of this study is to identify and classify the various moves and steps, as well as the rhetorical structures, employed by Indonesian undergraduate students in writing their concluding chapters. To achieve this objective, we selected ten concluding chapters from the Indonesian university repository, focusing specifically on theses within the field of Teaching English as a Foreign Language (TEFL). By analysing these chapters, the study aims to provide a comprehensive overview that can serve as a guide for students and researchers in crafting effective conclusion chapters.

Our research is grounded in the framework developed by Chen and Kuo (2012), which offers a systematic approach to analysing academic writing. The corpus for this study comprises 4.210 words, offering a substantial basis for detailed examination. Through this analysis, we aim to illuminate the common patterns and structures used in conclusion chapters, highlighting the number and types of moves and steps that contribute to a well-structured conclusion.

The findings of this study are intended to be particularly useful for readers engaged in writing conclusion chapters, providing them with clear examples and a structured approach based on empirical data. By understanding the prevalent rhetorical strategies used by their peers, students can enhance their own academic writing, ensuring that their conclusions are both coherent and impactful.

### ***Move 1 (Introducing the conclusion chapter)***

From the results presented, we consider Step 1 to be a mandatory step in the concluding chapters, as it appears in all ten conclusion chapters of the theses analyzed, representing 21.28% of the whole. According to Chen & Kuo's (2012) model, Move 1 (Introducing the conclusion chapter) is a crucial component in the structure of conclusion chapters. It should be designed and prominently displayed in academic writing, particularly in TEFL theses, to ensure clarity and coherence. This finding aligns with the research conducted by Nguyen & Pramoolsook (2016) who also found that Move 1 (Introducing the conclusion chapter) appeared 20 times, accounting for 83.3% of their data. This consistency of the findings across studies underscores the importance of Move 1 (Introducing the conclusion chapter) to TEFL students as a standard practice of conclusion writing.

### *Move 2 Step 1 (Summarizing the study briefly)*

As this research belongs to the last chapter of all theses, a concise overview of the research is required, as illustrated in the present findings. Move 2 Step 1 (Summarizing the study) is an essential component of writing the concluding chapter. In scientific writing particularly in TEFL master's theses, this step should be meticulously organized and prominently presented, as emphasized by Chen & Kuo's (2012) framework. Our finding aligns with the research conducted by Amnuai & Wannaruk (2013) who examined 20 Corpus English research articles and discovered that Move 2 Step 1 was present in 95% of foreign corpora and 85% of Thai corpora, underscoring its essential role in summarizing research.

Additionally, Shirani & Chalak (2018) analyzed the final sections of PhD theses and concluded that Move 2 Step 1 was included in every thesis they studied, reinforcing its necessity. Our findings also highlight the importance of Move 2 Step 1 has a total percentage of 21.28%. Our evidence indicates that summarizing the study is a crucial and common practice in the final chapters of undergraduate theses, ensuring that the research is clearly and concisely presented to the readers.

### *Move 3 (Evaluating study)*

Move 3 (Evaluating the study) is a step that essentially aims for the authors to discuss the importance and benefits of their research, as well as identify any shortcomings, and then assess whether the techniques used were appropriate. This evaluation is important to provide a comprehensive understanding of the study's contribution and areas that require improvement in the future. However, in this study, the findings of Move 3 (Evaluating the study) showed that this step was the least occurring step compared to the other steps, with a total number of occurrences of 9 times (19.15%).

This result is in line and consistent with the research conducted by Amnuai & Wannaruk (2013) they found that Move 3 (Evaluating the study) is one of the optional moves, with a total number of occurrences of 5 times in the Thai corpus they analysed and 16 times in the international corpus. However, in another study conducted by Nguyen & Pramoolsook (2016), Move 3 was found to appear in 19 corpus out of the 24 corpus they analysed which means it has a fairly high frequency, indicating that differences may occur because the corpus analysed varies.

These findings highlight the importance of conducting thorough evaluations in academic studies, although in particular contexts this step may receive less attention. Effective evaluation can provide valuable insights for other researchers and assist in improving the quality of future research. Therefore, although Move 3 (Evaluating the study) in this study rarely appeared, this step is still considered essential in the preparation of the final chapter of the thesis, especially in ensuring that all aspects of the research have been critically considered and assessed.

#### ***Move 4 (Deduction from the research)***

Move 4 is the last step in Chen & Kuo's (2012) analytical framework, which functions as a coherent and effective closing of the conclusion chapter. In this study, it was found that Move 4 appeared 18 times (38.29%). Our finding is in line with a study conducted by Nguyen & Pramoolsook (2016), concluded that Move 4 is an obligatory move, with its appearance in 24 conclusion chapters (100%). Our finding is also supported by other studies, such as that conducted by Zamani & Ebadi (2016). In their study, Move 4 appeared 18 times (90%) of the international corpus they analysed, making Move 4 an obligatory move in conclusion writing.

The consistency of these findings suggests that Move 4 plays a crucial role in crafting an effective and coherent conclusion. This move helps to ensure that the conclusion chapter not only summarises the research but also provides a clear and logical closure. Therefore, integrating Move 4 in conclusion writing is crucial to strengthen the structure and academic quality of the paper.

Overall, the significant presence of Move 4 in various studies emphasises the importance of this step in the conclusion framework. This step not only helps to summarise the research findings but also provides a solid closure, which is important for the overall clarity and coherence of the academic texts. Thus, the use of Move 4 as an obligatory concluding step is a highly recommended practice in conclusion writing, particularly in academic contexts.

## **Conclusion**

This study investigates the rhetorical strategies and procedures used by Indonesian undergraduate students in the concluding chapters of their TEFL theses. The data was derived from ten postgraduate theses in the field of TEFL, obtained from the repository of one Indonesian university. The model proposed by Chen and Kuo (2012) was utilized to analyse the moves and steps within these concluding chapters. The results revealed that Move 4 (Deduction from the research) was the most frequently occurring move, appearing in 38.29% of the analysed texts, indicating its obligatory nature. This was followed by Move 1 (Introducing the conclusion chapter) and Move 2 (Summarizing the study), each with a frequency of 21.28%. Conversely, some moves, such as Move 3 Step 2 (Indicating limitations) and Move 4 Step 2 (Drawing pedagogic implications), appeared less frequently, each with a percentage of 4.26%. The findings from this study align with some previous research but also present contradictions with others, possibly due to the limited sample size analysed. This study's primary limitation is its analysis of only 10 theses, which allowing for detailed and in-depth examination. However, the findings are not generalizability to a broader population of undergraduate TEFL students.

In our thorough examination of the structures, writing styles, and formats preferred by Indonesian undergraduate students, we provide valuable insights for academic writers across various discourse communities on how to effectively arrange and structure their arguments, recommendations, and conclusion sections. Overall, the analysis of the final sections of TEFL undergraduate theses offers insightful information on the methodical processes and rhetorical devices employed by TEFL students. By recognizing recurrent patterns and complementary processes, this study contributes to the advancement of academic writing practices in the field of TEFL. These insights can inform pedagogical approaches, thesis guidance, and technical support in diverse linguistic and cultural contexts, ultimately enhancing the quality and impact of academic writing in TEFL. Future research should expand the sample size beyond ten theses to increase the generalisability of the findings. Including more universities and more diverse regions in Indonesia will provide a more comprehensive understanding of the rhetorical strategies used in TEFL theses. Finally, incorporating qualitative methods, such as interviews with thesis writers and supervisors, may offer deeper insights into the motivations behind certain rhetorical choices, thus providing a more nuanced understanding of academic writing practices in TEFL.

## References

- Annuai, W., & Wannaruk, A. (2013). A move-based analysis of the conclusion sections of research articles published in international and Thai journals. *3L: Language, Linguistics, Literature*, 19(2), 53–63.
- Aslam, I., & Mehmood, A. (2014). Genre Analysis of Conclusion Sections of Pakistani Research Articles in Natural and Social Sciences. *Journal of Natural Sciences Research*, 4(22), 106–113.
- Aswadima, I. (2019). *Improving the Student's Achievement in Listening by Using Video at Grade XI of MAS Bani Hasyim Bahorok* [Universitas Islam Negeri Sumatera Utara]. <http://repository.uinsu.ac.id/>
- Avena, B., & Yumarnamto, M. (2022). Indonesian Students' Thesis Conclusions: Organizational Preferences and Pedagogical Implications. *LLT Journal: A Journal on Language and Language Learning*, 25(2), 709–728. <https://doi.org/10.24071/llt.v25i2.3715>
- Bhatia, V. K. (2002). Applied genre analysis : a multi-perspective model. *Iberica*, 19(3), 3–19. [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/284025940\\_Applied\\_genre\\_analysis\\_An\\_alytical\\_advances\\_and\\_pedagogical\\_procedures](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/284025940_Applied_genre_analysis_An_alytical_advances_and_pedagogical_procedures)
- Bunton, D. (2005). The structure of PhD conclusion chapters. *Journal of English for Academic Purposes*, 4(3), 207–224. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jeap.2005.03.004>
- Carter-thomas, S., & Rowley-jolivet, E. (2020). Three minute thesis presentations: Recontextualisation strategies in doctoral research. *Journal of English for Academic Purposes*, 20(2), 1–38. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jeap.2020.100897>
- Chen, T.-Y., & Kuo, C.-H. (2012). A Genre-Based Analysis of the Information Structure of Master's Theses in Applied Linguistics. *The Asian ESP Journal*, 8(1), 24–52.
- Coleman, P., Ed, M., Dip, N., & Ed, C. (2021). *Validity and Reliability within Qualitative Research in the Caring Sciences*. 14(3), 2041–2045.
- Faryadi, Q. (2019). PhD Thesis Writing Process: A Systematic Approach—How to Write Your Methodology, Results and Conclusion. *Creative Education*, 10(04), 766–783. <https://doi.org/10.4236/ce.2019.104057>
- Fikriyah, L. (2023). *The Effectiveness of Spelling Bee Game to Improve the Students' Pronunciation at Seventh Grade of SMP Islam Terpadu Nurul 'Ilmi Medan* [Universitas Islam Negeri Sumatera Utara]. <http://repository.uinsu.ac.id/>
- Fitria, T. N. (2022). Analysis of Efl Students' Difficulties in Writing and Completing English Thesis. *LLT Journal: Journal on Language and Language Teaching*, 25(1), 295–309. <https://doi.org/10.24071/llt.v25i1.3607>
- Graham, S., & Harris, K. R. (1997). Self-Regulation and Writing : Where Do We Go from Here ? *Contemporary Educational Psychology*, 22, 102–114. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203763353-9>
- Han, J., & Zhang, L. (2020). Teaching Culture in TEFL. *College of Foreign Language Education and International Business*, 11(1983), 447–451. <https://doi.org/10.4236/ce.2020.114032>
- Hirah, A. (2021). *The Effect of Applying Paired Story Telling Technique on Students' Reading Comprehension of Eight Grade at MTS Azzuhri Tanjung Morawa* [Universitas Islam Negeri Sumatera Utara]. <http://repository.uinsu.ac.id/>
- Ingram, T. (2021). *The Curious Predicament of an (un)Comfortable Thesis Conclusion: Writing with New Materialisms*. Auckland University of Technology. <https://doi.org/10.37514/INT-B.2021.1343.2.13>
- Irawan, A. R. (2020). *Utilizing Pictures Series to Improve the Students' Proficiency*



- Writing Skill of Recount Text at the Tenth Grade of Senior High School* [Universitas Islam Negeri Sumatera Utara]. <http://repository.uinsu.ac.id/>
- Kurniati, A. (2019). *Identifying Problems of Undergraduate Students in Producing Thesis Statement in Final Project*. Universitas Islam Negeri Ar-Raniry Banda Aceh.
- Malmkjær, K. (1991). *The Linguistics Encyclopedia*. Routledge 11 New Fetter Lane.
- Marpaung, S. A. (2021). *The Use of Visual Imagery Strategy to Improve the Students' Writing Skill of Recount Text at the Tenth Grade in MA. LAB. UINSU MEDAN* [Universitas Islam Negeri Sumatera Utara]. <http://repository.uinsu.ac.id/>
- Mestre-Mestre, E. M. (2017). An analysis of interactive and interactional strategies in Conclusions and Discussion sections in Masters Theses An analysis of interactive and interactional strategies in Conclusions and Discussion sections in Masters Theses. *Pragmalingüística*, 25(4), 416–438.
- Mohajan, H. K. (2017). Two Criteria for Good Measurements in Research : Validity and Reliability. *Annals of Spiru Haret University*, 17(83458), 58–82. <https://mp.ra.ub.uni-muenchen.de/83458/>
- Morales, R. C. (2012). Conclusions in Research Articles : A Filipino-Japanese Contrastive Rhetoric Study. *Philippine ESL Journal*, 8(1), 83–95.
- Moritz, M. E. W., Meurer, J. L., & Dellagnelo, A. K. (2008). Conclusions as Components of Research Articles across Portuguese as a Native Language, English as a Native Language, and English as a Foreign Language : A Contrastive Genre Study. *The ESPecialist*, 29(2), 233–253. <https://www.researchgate.net/publication/281497983>
- Nadeak, J. S. (2022). *An Analysis of Speech Act on English Teaching and Learning Process in SMP Muhammadiyah 51 Sidikalang* [Universitas Islam Negeri Sumatera Utara]. <http://repository.uinsu.ac.id/>
- Nguyen, L. T. T., & Pramoolsook, I. (2016). A move-based analysis of TESOL master's thesis conclusion chapters by Vietnamese postgraduates. *Global Journal of Foreign Language Teaching*, 6(1), 02–12. <https://doi.org/10.18844/gjflt.v6i1.222>
- Orwin, R.G. (1994). Evaluating coding decisions. In: H. Cooper and L.V. Hedges (Eds). *The Handbook of Research Synthesis* (pp.177-200). Russell Sage Foundation.
- Paltridge, B. (2002). Thesis and dissertation writing: An examination of published advice and actual practice. *English for Specific Purposes*, 21(2), 125–143. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0889-4906\(00\)00025-9](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0889-4906(00)00025-9)
- Pishghadam, R., & Zabihi, R. (2012). Crossing the threshold of Iranian TEFL. *Applied Research in English*, 1(1), 57–69.
- Prastica, R. (2021). *Improving Students' Writing Ability at Learning Procedure Text Using Reconstruction Activities Strategy at XI Grade Students of MAS PAB 2 Helvetia* [Universitas Islam Negeri Sumatera Utara]. <http://repository.uinsu.ac.id/>
- Raja Guk-Guk, A. N. B. (2019). *Using Facebook Closed Group to Improve the Students' Writing Skill in Recount Text at Tenth Grade Studentsof SMK Istiqlal Deli Tua* [Universitas Islam Negeri Sumatera Utara]. <http://repository.uinsu.ac.id/>
- Ruiying, Y., & Allison, D. (2003). Research articles in applied linguistics: Moving from results to conclusions. *English for Specific Purposes*, 22(4), 365–385. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0889-4906\(02\)00026-1](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0889-4906(02)00026-1)
- Sadeghi, K., & Khajepasha, A. S. (2015). Thesis writing challenges for non-native MA students. *Research in Post-Compulsory Education*, 20(3), 357–373. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13596748.2015.1063808>
- Salman, H. D., & Yaseen, N. Y. (2013). Problem of conclusion writing. *Iraqi Journal of Cancer and Medical Genetics*, 6(2), 109–114.
- Shirani, S., & Chalak, A. (2018). Genre Analysis of Iranian TEFL Students' Master Theses. *Advances in Language and Literary Studies*, 9(2), 31.

- <https://doi.org/10.7575/aiac.all.v.9n.2p.31>
- Siahaan, M. B. (2020). *Improving Students' Listening Skills Through Podcast at MTS Islamiyah Gunting Saga* [Universitas Islam Negeri Sumatera Utara]. <http://repository.uinsu.ac.id/>
- Simandan, D. (2019). Revisiting positionality and the thesis of situated knowledge. *Dialogues in Human Geography*, 9(2), 129–149. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2043820619850013>
- Swales, J. M. (2014). *Research Genres Explorations and Applications* (Issue January). Cambridge University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9781139524827>
- Vasudevan, H., Yee, C. M., & Subramaniam, A. (2023). *The Steps of Writing A Graduate Thesis* (Z. Bin Mohamed (ed.)). Universiti Tun Abdul Razak (Unirazak).
- Vazifehdan, S. N., & Amjadiparvar, A. (2016). A Generic Analysis of the conclusion section of Research Articles in the field of sociology : A Comparative study. *Journal of Language and Translation*, 6(2), 63–77.
- Wang, X., & Yang, L. (2012). Problems and Strategies in Learning to Write a Thesis Proposal: A Study of Six M.A. Students in a TEFL Program. *Chinese Journal of Applied Linguistics*, 35(3), 324–341. <https://doi.org/10.1515/cjal-2012-0024>
- Zamani, G., & Ebadi, S. (2016). Move Analysis of Conclusions as Components of Research Articles in Persian and English. *Cypriot Journal of Educational Sciences*, 11(1), 09. <https://doi.org/10.18844/cjes.v11i1.344>